HCDistrictclerk.com HOLDER, CHAD vs. STATE FARM MUTUAL

INSURANCE

Cause: 201925330 CDI: 7 Court: 061

5/28/2019

DOCUMENTS

Number	Document	Post Jdgm		Pgs
85060064	Citation		05/01/2019	2
84971272	Civil Process Pick-Up Form		04/24/2019	1
84876024	Plaintiff's First Amended Original Petition		04/16/2019	3
-> 84876025	Request for Issuance of Service		04/16/2019	1
84723801	Plaintiff's Original Petition		04/09/2019	3

نا/18/2019 2:29 PM Marilyn Burgess - District Clerk Harris County Envelope No. 32905140 By: Chandra Lawson Filed: 4/16/2019 11:15 AM

CAUSE NO. 2019-25330

CHAD HOLDER	· §	IN THE DISTRICT COURT
	§	•
	§	·
V.	§	<u>061ST</u> JUDICIAL DISTRICT
	. §	
STATE FARM MUTUAL	§	•
INSURANCE CO.	8	HARRIS COUNTY, TEXAS

PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED ORIGINAL PETITION

TO THE COURT:

Plaintiff, Chad Holder, files this first amended original petition against Defendant, State Farm Mutual Insurance Co., and shows:

DISCOVERY

1. Plaintiff alleges that discovery is intended to be conducted under Level 2 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure.

PARTIES

- 2. Plaintiff, Chad Holder, is an individual residing in Harris County, Texas.
- 3. Defendant, State Farm Mutual Insurance, is an insurance company doing business in Texas that may be served with process though its registered agent, Corporation Service Company, at 211 E. 7th Street, Ste. 620, Austin, Texas 78701, or wherever it may be found.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

4. This court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case because the amount in controversy is within the jurisdictional limits of this court. Venue is proper in this court according to Texas Civil Practice and Remedies Code sections 15.002 and 15.035 because all or a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claim arose in Harris County, Texas.

BACKGROUND

5. Plaintiff was provided with Defendant's insurance to protect his vehicles: a 2013 Ford F-150 and a 2012 BMW X5. The policy numbers are 332 4567-F06-53G and 320 5564-A22-53D 004. On or about August 20, 2017, Plaintiff's vehicles were flooded as a result of hurricane Harvey and suffered damages in the amount of approximately \$75,000.00. Plaintiff filed claims with the Defendant; the claim numbers are 53-00Q9-16X and 53-00R0-21V. Defendant refuses to pay the amount of the claim.

BREACH OF CONTRACT

6. Plaintiff sues Defendant for breach of contract.

DAMAGES AND ATTORNEY FEES

7. Plaintiff sues for actual damages in the amount of approximately \$75,000.00. Plaintiff also sues for reasonable and necessary attorney fees under Chapter 38 of the Civil Practice & Remedies Code. In this regard, Plaintiff sues for less than \$150,000.00.

JURY DEMAND

8. Plaintiff desires to have a jury decide this case. This request is filed over thirty days before this case has been scheduled for trial. Plaintiff has paid the jury fee as required by Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 216(b).

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, Chad Holder, prays for judgment against Defendant, State Farm Mutual Insurance, actual damages, special damages, reasonable attorney fees; cost of court; prejudgment interest, post-judgment interest, costs of court, and all other relief, legal and equitable, to which they are justly entitled, in an amount less than \$150,000.00.

[Signature on Next Page]

Respectfully submitted,

GARY E. PATTERSON, P.C.

By: /s/ Gary E. Patterson
Gary E. Patterson
State Bar No. 15590830
gpatterson@gpattersonlaw.com
1214 Elgin Street
Houston, Texas 77004
Tel. (713)223-3095
Fax. (713)510-1584
Attorney for Plaintiff

Tec. 4 as \$0.16-cv-01916 Mocument 1-3 Filed on 02/28/10 10-7300 Frage 9 of 19

CAUSE NO. 201925330

RECEIPT NO.

0.00

ATY

	*****	TR # 73615875
PLAINTIFF: HOLDER, CHAD vs. DEFENDANT: STATE FARM MUTUAL INSURANCE		In The 61st Judicial District Court of Harris County, Texas 61ST DISTRICT COURT Houston, TX
	CIMATION	

THE STATE OF TEXAS County of Harris

TO: STATE FARM MUTUAL INSURANCE CO BY SERVING ITS REGISTERED AGENT CORPORATION SERVICE COMPANY OR WHEREVER IT MAY BE FOUND 211 E 7TH STREET SUITE 620 AUSTIN TX 78701

Attached is a copy of PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED ORIGINAL PETITION

This instrument was filed on the 16th day of April, 2019, in the above cited cause number and court. The instrument attached describes the claim against you.

YOU HAVE BEEN SUED, You may employ an attorney. If you or your attorney do not file a written answer with the District Clerk who issued this citation by 10:00 a.m on the Monday next following the expiration of 20 days after you were served this citation and petition, a default judgment may be taken against you.

TO OFFICER SERVING:

This citation was issued on 24th day of April, 2019, under $my\ hand\ and\ seal$ of said Court.

Issued at request of:
PATTERSON, GARY E.
1214 ELGIN
HOUSTON, TX 77004
Tel: (713) 223-3095
Bar No.: 15590830

MARILYN BURGES:

MARILYN-BURGESS, District Clerk Harris County, Texas 201 Caroline, Houston, Texas 77002 (P.O. Box 4651, Houston, Texas 77210)

Generated By: CHAMBERS, WANDA ULW//11211099

OI	FICER/AUTHORIZED PERSON RETURN
Came to hand at o'clock	M., on the day of
Executed at (address)	iń
County at	o'clockM., on the day of,
, by delivering to	defendant, in person, a
true copy of this Citation together	with the accompanying copy(ies) of the Petition
attached thereto and I endorsed on To certify which I affix my hand or	said copy of the Citation the date of delivery. fficially this day of,
FEE: \$	
	ofCounty, Texas
Affiant	Deputy
On this day, signature appears on the foregoing he/she stated that this citation w return.	, known to me to be the person whose return, personally appeared. After being by me duly sworn as executed by him/her in the exact manner recited on the
SWORN TO AND SUBSCRIBED BEFORE ME,	on this day of,
	Notary Public



Notice of Service of Process

null / ALL

Transmittal Number: 19734456 **Date Processed: 05/01/2019**

Primary Contact: State Farm Enterprise SOP

Corporation Service Company- Wilmington, DELAWARE

251 Little Falls Dr

Wilmington, DE 19808-1674

Entity: State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company

Entity ID Number 3461675

Entity Served: State Farm Mutual Insurance Co

Title of Action: Chad Holder vs. State Farm Mutual Insurance Co.

Document(s) Type: Citation/Petition

Nature of Action: Contract

Court/Agency: Harris County District Court, TX

Case/Reference No: 2019-25330

Jurisdiction Served: Texas

Date Served on CSC: 04/30/2019

Answer or Appearance Due: 10:00 am Monday next following the expiration of 20 days after service

Originally Served On: CSC

How Served: Personal Service Gary E. Patterson 713-223-3095 Sender Information:

Information contained on this transmittal form is for record keeping, notification and forwarding the attached document(s). It does not constitute a legal opinion. The recipient is responsible for interpreting the documents and taking appropriate action.

To avoid potential delay, please do not send your response to CSC

251 Little Falls Drive, Wilmington, Delaware 19808-1674 (888) 690-2882 | sop@cscglobal.com

From: HOME CLMS-SALIR-SUITS

Sent: Thursday, May 2, 2019 12:12 PM

To:LT - AUTO - LitigationCc:Mark Randall; Sheila SmithSubject:53-00R0-21V, 53-00Q9-16X



DOC ID: 27922669

ROUTING LAWSUIT FOR REVIEW.THE DOCS WILL ALSO BE ROUTED TO LT EMAIL CAPTURE.SALIR SHOULD NOT BE ASSIGNED AS CLAIM OWNER OR COL ON ANY CLAIM.IF ASSIGNMENT IS RECEIVED IN ERROR IMMEDIATELY FORWARD TO THE APPROPRIATE SEGMENT.DO NOT RETURN TO SALIR.

CAUSE NO. 2019-25330

CHAD HOLDER Plaintiff,	§ §	IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF
	§	
VS.	§	HARRIS COUNTY, TEXAS
	§	
	§	
STATE FARM MUTUAL	§	61ST JUDICIAL DISTRICT
INSURANCE COMPANY	§	
Defendant	§	

STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE COMPANY'S ORIGINAL ANSWER

Defendant State Farm Mutual Automobile Insurance Company ("State Farm"), incorrectly named State Farm Mutual Insurance Company in Plaintiff's Original Petition, timely files its Original Answer in response to Plaintiff's Original Petition.

GENERAL DENIAL

1. Pursuant to Tex. R. Civ. Proc. 92, State Farm generally denies each and every allegation contained in Plaintiff's Original Petition and all amendments thereto, and demands strict proof thereof by a preponderance of the evidence.

SPECIFIC DENIAL

2. Absence of Conditions Precedent for Physical Damage Coverage. Pursuant to Rule 54 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, State Farm specifically denies that all conditions precedent to coverage under the Policy have occurred or been performed with respect to each of the two claims at issue in this matter because: (1) Plaintiff has failed to complete his examination under oath and/or submit to an examination under at State Farm's request; and (2) Plaintiff has not provided State Farm with all pertinent records and additional documentation which it requested.

DEFENSES

3. Absence of Condition Precedent for Physical Damage Coverage. Plaintiff has not complied with all conditions precedent to coverage under the Policy, nor have those conditions occurred or been performed, because Plaintiff has refused to cooperate with State Farm; failed and refused to allow State Farm to complete his examination under oath with respect to his claims; and has failed to provide pertinent records to State Farm as it has requested under the policies at issue. State Farm has, consequently, been prejudiced. Specifically, State Farm repeatedly requested for Plaintiff to comply with the following conditions of the policies under which he submitted these claims:

INSURED'S DUTIES

* * * * *

3. Insured's Duty to Cooperate With Us

- a. The *insured* must cooperate with us and, when asked, assist *us* in:
 - * * * * *
 - (2) securing and giving evidence . . .

.

4. Questioning Under Oath

Under:

* * * * *

c. Physical Damage Coverages, each *insured* or owner of a *covered vehicle*, or any other *person* or legal entity making claim or seeking payment;

must, at *our* option, submit to an examination under oath, provide a statement under oath, or do both, as reasonably often as *we* require. Such *person* or legal entity must answer questions under oath, asked by anyone *we* name, and sign copies of the answers. *We* may require each *person* or legal entity answering questions under oath to answer the questions with only that *person*'s or legal entity's legal representative, *our* representatives, any *person* or *persons* designated by *us* to record the questions and answers, and no other *person* present. However, a parent or guardian of the *insured*, if the *insured* is a minor, may also be present.

5. Other Duties Under the Physical Damage Coverages

When there is a *loss*, *you* or the owner of the *covered vehicle* must:

* * * * *

- d. provide *us* all pertinent:
 - (1) records;
 - (2) receipts;
 - (3) invoices; and
 - (4) authorizations

that we request and allow us to make copies; and

e. not abandon the covered vehicle to us.

Texas courts have long-held that "insurance policy provisions requiring the insured to submit to an [examination under oath] are valid." Furthermore, an insured's refusal or failure to submit to an examination under oath after a loss suspends the insured's right of recovery.²

- 4. **Pre-Judgment Interest.** Any award of prejudgment interest is, in effect, an award of punitive damages and, as such, would violate both the Texas and United States Constitutions, public policy, and/or otherwise be illegal. Further, any award of interest that is in excess of the applicable market rate of interest during the relevant time period would be arbitrary, violate public policy, and violate the due process and equal protection guarantees of the Texas and United States Constitutions.
- 5. **Policy Limit of Liability**. State Farm's contractual liability cannot exceed the limits set forth in the policies under which Plaintiff sues.
- 6. **Additional Pleadings.** State Farm affirmatively pleads all affirmative defenses, privileges and immunities available under the common law, the Texas Civil Practices & Remedies Code, by statute or otherwise. State Farm affirmatively pleads all available

Perrotta v. Farmers Inc. Exch., 47 S.W.3e 569, 573 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 2001, no pet.).

See Philadelphia Underwriters' Agency of Fire Ins. Ass'n v. Driggers, 111 Tex. 392, 238 S.W. 633, 635 (Tex. 1922).

contractual limitations, all available limitations set out in the Texas Civil Practices & Remedies Code, all available statutory limitations provisions available otherwise.

JURY DEMAND

7. State Farm respectfully demands a trial by jury.

PRAYER

State Farm prays that Plaintiff take nothing by this suit, that State Farm recover all costs incurred herein, and that the Court grant such other and further relief, at law or in equity, to which State Farm may show itself justly entitled.

Respectfully submitted,

NISTICO, CROUCH & KESSLER, P.C.

By: /s/ M. Micah Kessler
Micah Kessler
State Bar No. 00796878
mkessler@nck-law.com
Morgan Y. Bird
State Bar No. 24109646
mbird@nck-law.com
1900 West Loop South, Suite 800
Houston, Texas 77027

Telephone: 713-781-2889 Telecopier: 713-781-7222 **ATTORNEY FOR DEFENDANT.**

STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE

INSURANCE COMPANY

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

This pleading was served in compliance with Rules 21 and 21a of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure on May 28, 2019.

Gary E. Patterson Gary E. Patterson, P.C. 1214 Elgin Street Houston, Texas 77004 VIA E-FILE

> <u>/s/ Morgan Y. Bird</u> Morgan Y. Bird

Envelope Details Page 1 of 2

Case 4:19-cv-01915 Document 1-3 Filed on 05/28/19 in TXSD Page 18 of 19

Print this page

Case # 201925330 - HOLDER, CHAD v STATE FARM MUTUAL INSURANCE

Case Information

Location Harris County - 61st Civil District Court

Date Filed 5/28/2019 9:24 AM

Case Number 201925330

Case Description HOLDER, CHAD v STATE FARM MUTUAL INSURANCE

Assigned to Judge

Attorney M Kessler

Firm Name Nistico Crouch & Kessler PC

Filed By Tyffeni Nguyen

Filer Type Attorney

Fees

Convenience Fee \$1.21 **Total Court Case Fees** \$0.00 **Total Court Party Fees** \$0.00 **Total Court Filing Fees** \$40.00 **Total Court Service Fees** \$2.00 Total Filing & Service Fees \$0.00 **Total Provider Service Fees** \$0.00 Total Provider Tax Fees \$0.00 Total Taxes (for non-court \$0.00

fees)

Grand Total \$43.21

Payment

Account Name AMEX 6004

Transaction Amount \$43.21

Transaction Response

Transaction ID 50756747 Order # 033883832-0

Answer/ Response / Waiver

Filing Type EFileAndServe

Filing Code Answer/ Response / Waiver Filing Description State Farm's Original Answer

Reference Number Hold, Chad

Comments

Envelope Details Page 2 of 2

Case 4:19-cv-01915 Document 1-3 Filed on 05/28/19 in TXSD Page 19 of 19

Status Submitting

Fees

Court Fee \$40.00 Service Fee \$0.00

Optional Services

Jury Fee \$40.00

Documents

Lead Document 20190520 - Holder, Paul - SF OA.pdf [Original]

eService Details

Name/Email	Firm	Service Method	Status	Served	Date/Time Opened
Gary E. Patterson gpatterson@gpattersonlaw.com	1	EServe	Not Sent	No	Not Opened
Morgan Bird mbird@nck-law.com	NCK, PC	EServe	Not Sent	No	Not Opened
Micah Kessler mkessler@nck-law.com	Nistico Crouch & Kessler, PC	EServe	Not Sent	No	Not Opened
Tyffeni Nguyen tnguyen@nck-law.com	Nistico, Crouch & Kessler	EServe	Not Sent	No	Not Opened